

---

**AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY ANALYSIS  
AND  
DETERMINATION**

**2012 Metropolitan Transportation Plan and 2013 Federal  
Transportation Improvement Program**

**Prepared by:  
Butte County Association of Governments**

Adopted (original) by BCAG Board: 12/13/2012

Approved (original) by FTA/FHWA: 01/28/2013

Adopted (redetermination) by BCAG Board: 06/27/2013

Approved (redetermination) by FTA/FHWA: mm/dd/yyyy



Butte County Association of Governments  
2580 Sierra Sunrise Terrace, Suite 100  
Chico, CA 95928  
530-879-2468  
<http://www.bcag.org>



---

**RESOLUTION OF THE BUTTE COUNTY ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS  
APPROVAL OF AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY REDETERMINATION FOR THE 2012  
METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION PLAN AND 2013 FEDERAL  
TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM**

**WHEREAS,** the Butte County Association of Governments is the designated Metropolitan Planning Organization for Butte County in accordance with 23 USC 134(b)(6); and Section 450.306 of the Metropolitan and Statewide Planning Rule;

**WHEREAS,** on March 27, 2008, the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) strengthened the 8-hour ozone national ambient air quality standard (NAAQS). Following a lengthy approval process, the 2008 ozone NAAQS became effective July 20, 2012. Areas that do not meet the 2008 ozone NAAQS, including Butte County, are designated as non-attainment. As a result of the areas non-attainment designation, conformity is required to be re-determined for the 2012 Metropolitan Transportation Plan (MTP) and 2013 Federal Transportation Improvement Program (FTIP) for the new 8-hour ozone standard by July 20, 2013;

**WHEREAS,** BCAG has performed an ozone conformity redetermination which reaffirms all applicable conformity findings for the 2012 MTP and the 2013 FTIP and addresses additional emissions analyses and interagency consultation and public involvement required for the new 8-hour ozone standard. Based on the preparation of the redetermination and analysis, the 2013 Federal Transportation Improvement Program (FTIP) and 2012 MTP/SCS conforms to the applicable State Implementation Plan (SIP) and all applicable sections of the EPA's Transportation Conformity Rule;

**WHEREAS,** on April 19, 2013, BCAG published a notice to provide the public with the opportunity to review and comment regarding the proposed action for the air quality conformity redetermination. A copy of the public notice and BCAG's emissions analysis and redetermination for the 2012 MTP and 2013 FTIP were made available online at <http://www.bcag.org/Planning/2012-MTP/index.html>. Hardcopies of the document were also made available at the BCAG offices and each of the Butte County Public Libraries;

**NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** that the Butte County Association of Governments does hereby approve and adopt the Air Quality Conformity Analysis and Redetermination for the 2012 Metropolitan Transportation Plan and 2013 Federal Transportation Improvement Program.

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED** that the results from the conformity analysis show that current and future emissions of the ozone precursors ROG and NOx will be less than 2002 and 2011 emissions levels, current and future carbon monoxide emissions will be below their budget threshold of 80 tons per day, and future emissions of 24-hour PM2.5 and its precursor NOx will be less than the 2008 emissions levels. Thus, Butte County, in accordance with the Transportation Conformity Rule requirements applicable to Butte County (§51.464 and §51.436 – 51.440), has satisfied the requirements of the “no-greater-than-2002” test for the 1997 8-hour federal ozone NAAQS, the “no-greater-than-2011” test for the 2008 8-hour federal ozone NAAQS, the “budget test” for carbon monoxide for the 80-tons-per-day budget, and the “no-greater-than-2008” test for federal 24-hour PM2.5 NAAQS. **Based on this analysis, the 2012 Metropolitan Transportation Plan (MTP) and 2013 Federal Transportation Improvement Program (FTIP) conforms to the applicable State Implementation Plan (SIP) and all applicable sections of the EPA’s Transportation Conformity Rule.**

---

**PASSED AND ADOPTED** by the Butte County Association of Governments on the 27th day of June, 2013 by the following vote:

**AYES:**

Connelly, Kirk, Teeter, Lambert, Wahl, Thompson, Stone, Fichter, Dahlmeier, Rawlings

**NOES:**

None

**ABSENT:**

Gruendl, Titus, Busch

**ABSTAIN:**

None

**APPROVED:**

*Bill Connelly*

\_\_\_\_\_  
BILL CONNELLY, CHAIR  
BUTTE COUNTY ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS

**ATTEST:**

*[Signature]*  
\_\_\_\_\_  
JON A. CLARK, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR  
BUTTE COUNTY ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<u>SECTION</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
PURPOSE .....	1
BUTTE COUNTY’S AIR QUALITY STATUS .....	1
CONFORMITY CRITERIA AND PROCEDURES .....	3
REGIONAL EMISSIONS ANALYSIS AND FORECAST .....	13
AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY DETERMINATION.....	16
APPENDIX A – EXEMPT TRANSPORTATION PROJECT LIST .....	17
APPENDIX B – PUBLIC MEETING DOCUMENTATION.....	18
APPENDIX C – RESPONSE TO PUBLIC COMMENTS .....	19
APPENDIX D – CONFORMITY CHECKLIST .....	20

# AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY ANALYSIS AND RE-DETERMINATION

## **Purpose**

The Butte County Association of Governments (BCAG) is the designated Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO) in Butte County, California, and is responsible for regional transportation planning. The purpose of this conformity determination is to ensure that BCAG's plans and programs "conform" to all applicable federal air quality requirements.

The Clean Air Act Section 176I (42 U.S.C. 7506 I) and EPA's transportation conformity regulations (40 CFR 93.104(b) and (c)) require that each new regional transportation plan (RTP) and transportation improvement plan (TIP) be demonstrated to conform to the State Implementation Plan (SIP) before the RTP and FTIP are approved by the MPO or accepted by the U.S. Department of Transportation (DOT). This ensures that federally supported highway and transit project activities will not cause new air quality violations, worsen existing violations, or delay timely attainment of the relevant national ambient air quality standards (NAAQS). Conformity currently applies under EPA's rules to areas that are designated non-attainment, and those re-designated to attainment after 1990 ("maintenance areas").

The region's last conformity determination was adopted by the BCAG Board of Directors on December 13th, 2012 as part of the 2012 Metropolitan Transportation Plan (MTP) and 2013 Federal TIP Amendment #1.

This transportation air quality conformity redetermination and emissions analysis shows that transportation projects programmed in the 2012 Butte County Metropolitan Transportation Plan (MTP) and 2013 Federal Transportation Improvement Program (FTIP) Amendment #1 are consistent with the applicable SIP.

## **Butte County's Air Quality Status**

### **Ozone**

Effective July 20, 2012, Butte County is designated marginal nonattainment under EPA's federal 2008 8-hour ozone National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS). Under this proposal, BCAG is required to prepare a new conformity determination by July 20, 2013 in order to demonstrate conformity for the 2008 ozone NAAQS.

Butte County is also designated marginal nonattainment for ozone under EPA's federal 1997 8-hour ozone National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS). EPA's final rule implementing the 2008 ozone NAAQS also revoked the 1997 ozone NAAQS for transportation conformity purposes. This revocation is effective on July 20, 2013.

Because of these designations, transportation projects occurring within Butte County are subject to an air quality conformity determination for the ozone precursors Reactive Organic Gases (ROG) and Oxides of Nitrogen (NOx).

Previously, under EPA's 1-hour ozone rule, Butte County was designated "non-attainment – transitional" (Section 185A) and was not required to develop an attainment SIP with an emissions budget.

Since no emissions budget exists from a prior SIP submittal that has been found adequate by EPA, or was part of an approved SIP, an interim conformity test applies. In order to make a conformity determination under the 2008 federal 8-hour standard, future emissions of ROG and NOx must be no greater than 2011 emissions levels, or the build/no-build test must be passed. In order to make a conformity determination under the 1997 federal 8-hour standard, future emissions of ROG and NOx must be no greater than 2002 emissions levels, or the build/no-build test must be passed.

### Carbon Monoxide

As a result of a 1998 SIP revision approved by EPA, Butte County (Chico Urbanized area) was redesignated from non-attainment to attainment with a Maintenance SIP for carbon monoxide (CO). In 2007, the 1998 Maintenance SIP was updated by ARB and approved by EPA for the second decade of the maintenance period. Conformity applies for CO through 2018. The current emission budget is for the second Maintenance SIP. As a maintenance area, BCAG continues to be required to demonstrate conformity for CO.

In order to show conformity for CO, BCAG must show that future emissions will be less than the CO emissions budget assigned to Butte County (budget test). Butte County's emissions budget of 80-tons per day is specified in the *2004 Revision to the California State Implementation Plan for Carbon Monoxide*. EPA published a direct final rulemaking approving the plan on November 20, 2005, effective January 30, 2006. Based on the designated maintenance status, Butte County needs to demonstrate that vehicular emissions forecasts will not exceed 80 tons/day and are consistent with the applicable State Implementation Plan (SIP).

### Fine Particulate Matter (PM2.5)

Effective December 14, 2009, Butte County (partial) was designated as non-attainment for fine particulate matter (PM2.5) under the EPA 2006 24-hour PM2.5 NAAQS. Transportation conformity for the 2006 PM2.5 NAAQS applies one year after the effective date. Therefore, Butte County conformity applies December 14, 2010.

As a newly designated non-attainment area for PM2.5, no emissions budget currently exists from an approved SIP, therefore an interim conformity test applies. In order to make a conformity determination under the 2006 24-hour PM2.5 standard, future

emissions of PM2.5 and Nox must be no greater than 2008 emissions levels, or the build/no-build test must be passed.

## **Conformity Criteria and Procedures**

### Planning Assumptions

The emissions estimates developed for this conformity determination were based on the latest planning assumptions available for Butte County in accordance with 40 CFR 93.110 of the Federal Conformity Rule. BCAG has the responsibility to develop estimates and forecasts of population, employment, travel, and congestion for the Metropolitan Transportation Plan (MTP) and for preparation of the required air quality conformity emissions analysis and determination. Forecasts for population and employment are incorporated into the countywide transportation model database used by BCAG.

The initial modeling for the 2012 MTP conformity analysis began on January 10, 2011. A comprehensive update of the BCAG traffic model was completed in July 2012 and the population, housing, and employment projections identified in BCAGs [Butte County Long-Term Regional Growth Forecasts 2010-2035](#) are the same as those used in the updated model. The model was validated in 2012 for the 2010 base year, and utilizes TransCAD V5.0 modeling software. The latest planning assumptions used in the transportation model validation and conformity analysis is summarized in Table 1.



**Table 1**  
**Summary of Latest Planning Assumptions for the BCAG Conformity Analysis**  
**40 CFR 93.110**

Assumption	Year and Source of Data (MPO Action)	Modeling	Next Scheduled Update
Population	Base Year: 2010 CA DOF Projections: based on BCAG's <a href="#">Butte County Long-Term Regional Growth Forecasts 2010-2035</a> , prepared January 2011. Modeling utilizes "medium scenario" included in the plan.	Included in developing latest BCAG regional transportation model and land use allocations for the years 2020 and 2035.	Next update to population forecasts is anticipated to be in January 2015.
Employment	Base Year: 2010 CA EDD Projections: based on BCAG's <a href="#">Butte County Long-Term Regional Growth Forecasts 2010-2035</a> , prepared January 2011. Modeling utilizes "medium scenario" included in the plan.	Included in developing latest BCAG regional transportation model and land use allocations for the years 2020 and 2035.	Next update to employment forecasts is anticipated to be in January 2015.
Traffic Counts	Base Year: 2009/10 The transportation model was validated to the base year using year 2009/10 traffic counts collected by Caltrans, local jurisdictions, and BCAG.	Latest BCAG regional transportation model was validated using counts.	Traffic counts are updated every 4 years, dependent upon availability of funding.
Vehicle Miles of Travel	The transportation model was validated in 2012 to the 2010 base year.	TransCAD V5 is the model used to estimate VMT for the BCAG regional transportation model.	VMT is an output of the transportation model; VMT is affected by the MTP/FTIP project updates and is included in each new emissions analysis.
Speeds	The transportation model uses industry-standard volume delay curves. Baseline speeds are set according to posted and surveyed speeds and the speeds are sensitive to the amount of traffic on the roadway segments.	TransCAD v5 and EMFAC 2011	Speed data is updated every 4 years, dependent upon availability of funding.
Vehicle Registration	EMFAC 2011 is the most recent federally approved model for use in California conformity analysis. Vehicle registration is included by ARB in the model and cannot be updated by the user.	EMFAC 2011	The next update is scheduled to occur in 2015.
Transit	Base Year: 2010 American Community Survey 3-year estimates Projections: based on BCAG's transportation forecasts which project a 0.11% increase of transit mode share from 2010 levels. These levels assume transit fares remain constant in 2010 dollars.	TransCAD v5 and BCAG off-model transit forecasting tool	The next update of the land use forecasts and transit mode share is scheduled to occur in 2015.

### BCAG Transportation Model

The transportation conformity rule (TCR) section 93.122(b) requires the use of network-based transportation models for serious, severe, and extreme ozone non-attainment areas if their metropolitan planning region contains an urbanized population of more than 200,000. Butte County does not contain an urbanized area of that size, nor does it have an ozone classification of serious or greater. However, BCAG has used a

network-based model in the past and has continued to with the recent transportation model update. The BCAG transportation model meets the requirements of TCR 93.122.

The BCAG transportation model is consistent in form and function with the standard traffic forecasting models used in the transportation planning profession. The model is a three step travel demand forecasting model consisting of Trip Generation, Trip Distribution, and Trip Assignment and produces forecasts for daily, AM peak hour, and PM peak hour conditions. In addition, the model is calibrated to traffic counts for what is conventionally termed a “typical workday”, which is defined as a Tuesday, Wednesday, or Thursday during a week with no holidays and when schools are in session. The model utilizes TransCAD V5.0 software, which is consistent with many of the models used by local jurisdictions in California and Caltrans.

### *Traffic Counts*

The transportation model was validated to the 2010 base year using traffic count data collected from several sources including Caltrans, Butte County, and BCAG.

### *Speeds*

The transportation model uses industry-standard volume delay curves as part of the traffic modeling process. The baseline speeds in the model are set according to the posted speeds and checked with observed speed data. Speeds are sensitive to the amount of traffic on the roadway segments. For example, as roadway segment volumes increase, the link speed decreases

Speed distributions were updated in EMFAC 2011, using methodology approved by ARB and with information from the transportation model.

### *Transit*

As with previous versions of the BCAG transportation model, there is no transit component in the current model. However, BCAG has the ability to forecast ridership using an off-model tool and utilize these assumptions when preparing the emissions analysis. For the purpose of preparing the emissions analysis, BCAG assumes a minor increase in transit mode share of 0.11%. This represents an increase from a 1% mode share in 2010, based on information from the 2008-2010 American Community Survey 3-year estimates, to a 1.11% mode share in 2035. It is also assumed that transit fares will remain constant in 2010 dollars over the 25 year period of the analysis.

## *Land Use*

The 2010 base year land use data for the model was developed utilizing the Butte County Assessor's database which was verified with the cities, town, and county's existing land use information along with 2010 aerial photos, field observations, and vendor supplied business data.

The transportation model's future year land use data was developed with the assistance of the local jurisdictions planning staff and is based on land use information from the areas local land use plans, planned development, reasonable assumptions regarding infill and redevelopment, regional growth forecasts, and a review of development attractions (i.e., motorized and non-motorized transportation networks, existing development, service areas, etc.) and discouragements (i.e., resource areas and farmland, public lands, areas exceeding 25% slope, etc.). The general plan and specific plan development activities occurring in the county by the local jurisdictions are reflected in the future year land use assumptions, which are generally representative of the best available information as of June 30<sup>th</sup>, 2011.

The transportation model contains 912 transportation analysis zones (TAZ's) within which land use data is summarized into the following 17 categories:

- Single-Family Residential (dwelling units – du)
- Multi-Family Residential (du)
- Mobile Home Residential (du)
- Neighborhood-Serving Retail (1,000 square feet – ksf)
- Region Serving Retail (ksf)
- Industrial (ksf)
- Office (ksf)
- Medical Office (ksf)
- Hospital (ksf)
- Public-Quasi Public (ksf)
- Hotels (rooms)
- University (students)
- Community College (students)
- K-12 Schools (students)
- Park (acres)
- Special Generator for Casino (slots)
- External Trip Distribution for Casino (trips)

## *Road Network*

The roadway network is based on the BCAG centerline road network and contains all existing and future roadway classifications of "local" and above which were developed considering local jurisdictions circulation elements of their general plans and Caltrans

California Road System (CRS) maps. The road network includes all regionally significant roadways.

Future road networks prepared for emissions analysis include all regionally significant and non-regionally significant federal, state, and locally funded, and non-exempt projects. Tables 3-6 contain these non-exempt projects sorted by conformity analysis year. In addition, all projects within the MTP/FTIP that are exempt from conformity requirements have been documented (see Appendix A).

### *Validation/Calibration*

The BCAG transportation model was validated to daily, AM and PM peak hour conditions. Detailed validation summary reports are available upon request. In general, the transportation model generates results that exceed the screenline and link volume validation standards established in Caltrans *Travel Forecasting Guidelines*, November 1992, and *Travel Model Improvement Program (TMIP) Model Validation and Reasonableness Checking Manual*, February 1997 for daily, AM and PM peak hour conditions. In addition, the model meets the specific static validation criteria contained in the *2010 California Regional Transportation Plan Guidelines*.

In addition to static tests, the BCAG TDF model's estimate of daily vehicle miles of travel (VMT) for Butte County was compared to independent estimates from the Highway Performance Monitoring System (HPMS).

### BCAG Consultation and Planning Process

BCAG has followed the latest Final Transportation Conformity Rule in preparing the air quality conformity determination for the 2012 MTP. The Final Conformity Rule requires that Regional Transportation Planning Agencies (RTPAs) develop an Air Quality Conformity Element to identify the procedures and criteria for developing air quality conformity determinations for their respective regions.

As the Regional Transportation Planning Agency (RTPA) for Butte County, BCAG has established a broad planning process and partnership with federal, state, and local governments, the Butte County Air Quality Management District, and the general public.

This planning process and partnership includes consultation through our Transportation Advisory Committees that is comprised of representatives from all levels of local government, state and federal agencies, the air district, the general public, and other affected agencies and interested citizens in Butte County. The Transportation Advisory Committee typically meets on a monthly basis as needed to review and provide input into all BCAG planning activities. The technical issues are resolved at this level, and recommendations are made to the BCAG Board of Directors.

## Specific Consultation

The transportation conformity document is required to be developed in consultation with BCAG's planning partners, and the opportunity must be provided for public review.

During the development of the air quality conformity analysis and determination, BCAG consulted with the **Interagency Consultation Review (ICR)** which reviewed and concurred with the emissions inventory, conformity analysis years, latest planning assumptions, project exemptions, as well as the methodology used to generate the emissions inventory. The ICR includes representatives from the Federal Highway Administration (FHWA), Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), Caltrans, Butte County Air Quality Management District and BCAG. The Federal Transit Administration was invited to participate as well. The latest interagency consultation process began on March 15, 2011 with a memorandum requesting confirmation of the approach and methods to be used in the redetermination and new emissions analysis.

Further, a Planning Partners group was created to provide input on the future land use allocations utilized in preparing the analysis. The Planning Partners group included representatives from each local jurisdiction within Butte County. The group reviewed all assumptions and inputs that went into the development of the land use assumptions and allocation.

### *Following paragraph effective May 23, 2013*

*BCAG staff provided a 30-day public review and comment period in compliance with BCAG's adopted Public Participation Plan (PPP). Legal notices were posted in local newspapers, and the conformity document was made available at local public libraries and on BCAG's website. The Air Quality Conformity Analysis and Determination were circulated among staff from Federal Highway Administration (FHWA), Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), Federal Transit Agency (FTA), and Caltrans. Appendices B and C contain copies of public notices and responses to public comments.*

## Financial Constraint

The 2013 FTIP has been financially constrained in accordance with the requirements of 40 CFR 93.108 and is consistent with the U.S. DOT metropolitan planning regulations (23 CFR Part 450). See Financial Element of 2012 MTP for further details.

## Transportation Control Measures

There are no TCMs in the CO SIP and there is no approved ozone or PM2.5 SIP applicable to Butte County. Because there are no TCMs in an approved SIP for Butte County, Butte County currently has no TCMs in place and therefore timely TCM implementation requirements do not apply.

## Vehicle Registrations

Butte County Association of Governments does not estimate vehicle registrations, age distributions or fleet mix. Rather, current forecasted estimates for these data are developed by the California Air Resources Board (CARB) and included in the EMFAC 2011 model. On March 6, 2013, EMFAC 2011 was approved by the federal government for use in California conformity analysis. Vehicle registrations, age distribution and fleet mix are developed and included in the model by CARB and cannot be updated by the user.

## Modeling Documentation

A complete description of BCAG's transportation model is available upon request. BCAG's transportation model, which was used to develop transportation-related emissions for the Butte County non-attainment and maintenance areas, currently meets all requirements set forth in the August 15, 1997 Federal Register.

## Emissions Models

In order to determine emissions associated with the implementation of the 2012 MTP, the most recent, federally approved, emissions model is used. To develop the air quality conformity analysis, two types of models were used: the BCAG transportation model and EMFAC.

The BCAG transportation model was used to prepare the traffic model runs for the necessary analysis years. The BCAG transportation model produced forecasts of vehicle miles traveled (VMT), trip ends, speed distributions, lane miles, and other travel related data required for the emission models.

BCAG used the most current federally approved emissions model to prepare the regional emissions analysis. At the time this document was prepared, March 2012, EMFAC 2011 was the latest federally approved model in California.

## Analysis Years

The regional emissions analysis begins with the year of 2015, as the transportation conformity rule states that the first emissions analysis year may not exceed five years from the year the RTP/FTIP conformity determination was prepared (2012). In addition, 2015 is the marginal attainment year for the 2008 ozone NAAQS. The next analysis year is the attainment year for CO under the 80-tons-per-day budget which is 2018. The milestone year of 2025 is included since analysis is required between years and can not be more than 10 years apart. The last year included in the emissions analysis is the long-range MTP horizon year of 2035.

A summary of the analysis years is indicated below:

- 2015 – No greater than five years from the preparation of the MTP and FTIP conformity determination, and 2008 ozone marginal attainment year
- 2018 – CO maintenance year (new 80 tons-per-day budget)
- 2025 – Milestone year no more than 10 years from last analysis
- 2035 – Horizon year of BCAG’s long-range RTP and additional analysis year for GHG

Projects Included in the Regional Emissions Analysis

The 2012 MTP and 2013 FTIP include all federal and non-federal regionally significant projects expected to occur in the Butte County ozone and PM2.5 non-attainment areas and Chico Urbanized Area carbon monoxide maintenance area. Projects included in this emissions analysis include all relevant projects contained in the 2012 MTP and 2013 FTIP that are assumed funded. The projects are those receiving federal transportation dollars as well as those that have been determined to be regionally significant regardless of funding type. All capacity increasing projects have been included in this conformity analysis as required by the Transportation Conformity Rule. The funding sources for which the specific list of projects is derived are listed in Table 2 below.

**Table 2  
RTP and FTIP Project Funding Sources**

APDE	Advanced Project Development Element (Derived from RIP/STIP)
CMAQ	Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality
CRTP	California Recreation Trails Program
HBRR	Highway Bridge Repair and Replacement Program
IIP	Interregional Improvement Program (Derived from STIP)
Local	Local Agency Funds (City/County funds)
PLH	Public Lands Highway Program
RIP	Regional Improvement Program (Derived from STIP)
SHOPP	State Highway Operations and Protection Program

The specific capacity-increasing projects included in each analysis year in the emissions analysis are included below in Tables 3, 4, 5, and 6. It is important to note that the 2018 model includes all projects listed in Table 3, the 2025 model includes all projects listed in Tables 3 and 4, and the 2035 model includes all projects listed in Tables 3, 4, and 5.

**Table 3  
Capacity-increasing Projects Included in 2015 Emissions Analysis**

<b>Jurisdiction</b>	<b>Roadway</b>	<b>Segment</b>	<b>Proposed Improvement</b>
Butte County	SR 70	Ophir Rd to Palermo Rd	Widen to 4 lanes
Chico	SR 99	SR 32 to E. 1 <sup>st</sup> Ave	Auxiliary lanes
Chico	Bruce Rd	Skyway to SR 32	Widen to 4 lanes
Chico	Eaton Rd	East Ave to Floral Ave	Construct 4 lane roadway
Chico	MLK Blvd	E. Park Ave to 20 <sup>th</sup> St	Widen to 4 lanes
Chico	SR 32	SR 99 to El Monte	Widen to 4 lanes
Chico	Eaton Rd	SR 99 interchange	Widen to 4 lanes
Chico	Cohasset Rd	Two Oaks Dr to Thorntree Dr	Widen to 4 lanes
Chico	Cohasset Rd	Airport Blvd to Eaton Rd	Widen to 4 lanes
Chico	Midway	Hegan Ln to E Park Ave	Widen to 4 lanes
Chico	Forest Ave	SR 32 to Humboldt Rd	Widen to 4 lanes

**Table 4  
Capacity-increasing Projects Included in 2018 Emissions Analysis\***

<b>Jurisdiction</b>	<b>Roadway</b>	<b>Segment</b>	<b>Proposed Improvement</b>
Chico	Eaton Rd	SR 32 to western termini	Construct 4 lane roadway
Chico	SR 32	El Monte Ave to Yosemite Dr	Widen to 4 lanes
Chico	SR 99	Skyway to 20 <sup>th</sup> St	Auxiliary lanes
Chico	East Ave	SR 99 interchange improvements	Reconfigure interchange
Chico	Notre Dame	E 20 <sup>th</sup> St to Little Chico Creek	Construct 2 lane roadway
Chico	Guyann Rd	Bridge @ Lindo Channel	Widen to 2 lanes
Butte County	Central House Rd	Bridge @ Wyman Ravine	Widen to 2 lanes
Paradise	Anchor Way	Clark Rd to Bennet Rd	Construct 2 lane roadway

\*Also includes all projects listed in Table 3.



**Table 5  
Capacity-increasing Projects Included in 2025 Emissions Analysis\***

Jurisdiction	Roadway	Segment	Proposed Improvement
Butte County	SR 70	Palermo Rd to E Gridley Rd	Widen to 4 lanes
Chico	SR 99	20 <sup>th</sup> St to SR 32	Auxiliary lanes
Chico	Notre Dame	Comanche Creek to Southgate Ave	Construct 2 lane roadway
Chico	Southgate	SR 99 interchange	Replace intersection with new 2 lane overpass
Chico	Fair St	Fair St to Entler Ave	Construct 2 lane roadway
Chico	E 20 <sup>th</sup> St	Notre Dame to Bruce Rd	Widen to 4 lanes
Chico	Silver Dollar Way	Fair St to MLK Blvd	Construct 2 lane roadway
Chico	Manzanita Ave	E 8 <sup>th</sup> St to Wildwood Ave	Widen to 4 lanes
Butte County	Kittyhawk Dr	SR 99 to Garner Ln	Construct 2 lane roadway
Chico	Esplanade	Eaton Rd to SR 99	Widen to 4 lanes
Chico	Southgate	Midway to SR 99 & SR 99 to Skyway	Construct 4 lane roadway

\*Also includes all projects listed in Tables 3 and 4.

**Table 6  
Capacity-increasing Projects Included in 2035 Emissions Analysis\***

Jurisdiction	Roadway	Segment	Proposed Improvement
Butte County	SR 70	E Gridley Rd to Yuba County	Widen to 4 lanes

\*Also includes all projects listed in Tables 3, 4 and 5.

### Eight-hour Ozone Standards

#### *2008 Ozone NAAQS*

Effective July 20, 2012, Butte County is designated marginal nonattainment under EPA's federal 2008 8-hour ozone National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS).

The conformity test to be used to demonstrate conformity to the 2008 8-hour federal ozone NAAQS is the "no-greater-than 2011" test whereby future emissions must be less than or equal to those emission present in 2011.

#### *1997 Ozone NAAQS*

On April 27, 2012 U.S. EPA finalized revisions to 2004 rule for the 1997 8-hour federal ozone NAAQS. Based on this standard, Butte County is designated as marginal nonattainment. EPA's final rule implementing the 2008 ozone NAAQS also revoked the 1997 ozone NAAQS for transportation conformity purposes. This revocation is effective on July 20, 2013.

The conformity test to be used to demonstrate conformity to the 1997 8-hour federal ozone NAAQS is the “no-greater-than 2002” test whereby future emissions must be less than or equal to those emission present in 2002.

### Carbon Monoxide “Budget Test”

Upon being redesignated from “non-attainment” to “maintenance” for carbon monoxide in 1998, BCAG was allocated a countywide emissions budget of 100 tons per day. As part of a July 2004 revision to the California State Implementation Plan (SIP) for Carbon Monoxide, Butte County’s CO emissions budget was changed to 80 tons per day.

The conformity test to be used to demonstrate conformity for CO is the “budget test” whereby CO emissions are not to exceed the 80 tons per day budget.

### Fine Particulate Matter (PM2.5)

On October 17, 2006 U.S. EPA promulgated the new 2006 24-hour PM2.5 standard. Based on this standard, a portion of Butte County (western) has been designated non-attainment. This new standard took effect December 14, 2009, at which time the old PM2.5 standard was revoked.

The conformity test to be used to demonstrate conformity to the 2006 24-hour PM2.5 standard is the “no-greater-than 2008” test whereby future emissions must be less than or equal to those emission present in 2008. The baseline year of 2008 is consistent with U.S. EPA’s finalized Transportation Conformity Rule PM2.5 and PM10 amendments signed March 10, 2010 and detailed in 40 CFR 93.119.

### Regional Emissions Analysis and Forecast

The regional emissions analysis and forecast for ozone precursors, carbon monoxide, PM2.5 and its precursor have been summarized in the following tables. The summary of emissions forecasts is derived from outputs of the EMFAC 2011 model. These tables show comparisons of:

ROG:	Reactive Organic Gases as an ozone precursor
NOx:	Oxides of Nitrogen as an ozone and PM2.5 precursor
CO:	Carbon Monoxide
PM2.5:	Fine Particulate Matter (smaller than 2.5 micrometers)

Ozone 8-hour Standard Tests – No-greater-than- 2002 and No-greater-than- 2011 Test

**Table 7**  
**ROG “No-greater-than-2002” and “No-greater-than-2011” Emissions Tests**

ROG – TONS PER DAY OF EMISSIONS				
Analysis Year	(EMFAC 2011 Summer Run)			
	ROG Emissions	Less than 2002?	Less than 2011?	Pass Conformity Tests?
2002	5.6	--	--	--
2011	3.7	yes	--	yes
2015	2.4	yes	yes	yes
2018	1.9	yes	yes	yes
2025	1.4	yes	yes	yes
2035	1.3	yes	yes	yes

**Table 8**  
**NOx “No-greater-than-2002” and “No-greater-than-2011” Emissions Tests**

NOx – TONS PER DAY OF EMISSIONS				
Analysis Year	(EMFAC 2011 Summer Run)			
	NOx Emissions	Less than 2002?	Less than 2011?	Pass Conformity Tests?
2002	10.7	--	--	--
2011	7.2	yes	--	yes
2015	5.1	yes	yes	yes
2018	3.9	yes	yes	yes
2025	2.5	yes	yes	yes
2035	2.2	yes	yes	yes

Carbon Monoxide Budget Test

**Table 9**  
**CO “Budget Test” Emissions Test 80 Tons-per-day Budget**

CO – TONS PER DAY OF EMISSIONS			
Analysis Year	(EMFAC 2011 Winter Run)		
	CO Emissions	CO Budget	Pass Conformity Test?
2015	20.8	80.0	yes
2018	15.5	80.0	yes
2025	10.6	80.0	yes
2035	9.5	80.0	yes

2006 24-hour PM2.5 Standard Test – No-greater-than-2008 Test

**Table 10  
24-hour PM2.5 “No-greater-than-2008” Emissions Test**

24-hour PM2.5 - TONS PER DAY OF EMISSIONS			
(EMFAC 2011 Winter Run)			
Analysis Year	PM2.5 Emissions	Less than 2008?	Pass Conformity Test?
2008	0.3	--	--
2015	0.2	yes	yes
2018	0.2	yes	yes
2025	0.2	yes	yes
2035	0.2	yes	yes

**Table 11  
NOx “No-greater-than-2008” Emissions Test**

NOx - TONS PER DAY OF EMISSIONS			
(EMFAC 2011 Winter Run)			
Analysis Year	NOx Emissions	Less than 2008?	Pass Conformity Test?
2008	10.3	--	--
2015	5.7	yes	yes
2018	4.3	yes	yes
2025	2.8	yes	yes
2035	2.4	yes	yes

## **Air Quality Conformity Determination**

The results from this conformity analysis show that current and future emissions of the ozone precursors ROG and NO<sub>x</sub> will be less than 2002 and 2011 emissions levels, current and future carbon monoxide emissions will be below their budget threshold of 80 tons per day, and future emissions of 24-hour PM<sub>2.5</sub> and its precursor NO<sub>x</sub> will be less than the 2008 emissions levels. Thus, Butte County, in accordance with the Transportation Conformity Rule requirements applicable to Butte County (§51.464 and §51.436 – 51.440), has satisfied the requirements of the “no-greater-than-2002” test for the 1997 8-hour federal ozone NAAQS, the “no-greater-than-2011” test for the 2008 8-hour federal ozone NAAQS, the “budget test” for carbon monoxide for the 80-tons-per-day budget, and the “no-greater-than-2008” test for federal 24-hour PM<sub>2.5</sub> NAAQS.

**Based on this analysis, the 2012 Metropolitan Transportation Plan (MTP) and 2013 Federal Transportation Improvement Program (FTIP) conforms to the applicable State Implementation Plan (SIP) and all applicable sections of the EPA’s Transportation Conformity Rule.**

# APPENDIX A

## BCAG Exempt Project Listing - 2012 MTP/SCS & 2013 FTIP Through Amendment #1

AGENCY	CTIPS ID	TITLE	PROJECT DESCRIPTION	Total (\$1,000s)	TRANSPORTATION CONFORMITY RULE - Exempt Reference			
County	1020000165	Neal Road and Cohasset Road Bike Project	On Neal Rd. from Oro-Chico Hwy to the Skyway & unincorporated portion of Cohasset Rd from Chico Limits to the Cohasset School. Construct Class 2 bike lanes.	1,580	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Air Quality	Bicycle and Pedestrian Facilities
County	1020000172	Midway Bridge Replacement across Butte Creek	On Midway (old SR 99) approximately 0.2 miles south of White Ave to approximately 0.7 miles south of White Ave, spanning Butte Creek and Butte Creek Overflow. Replace 2 bridge structures. (HBP project)	17,853	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Safety	Widening narrow pavements or reconstructing bridges (no additional travel lanes)
County	2020000070	Butte County HSIP Grouped Projects	Butte County HSIP Grouped Projects (Highway Safety Improvement Program) various local projects including HR3 as a result of MAP 21.	4,204	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Safety	Highway Safety Improvement Program implementation
County	2020000125	Las Plumas Federal Safe Routes to School Project	Between Waler Rd and Autrey Ln. Walmer Rd between Lincon Blvd and Rosedale Ave. Construct sidewalks, curb, gutter, ramps and AC tie-in; install speed humps and speed feedback signs; upgrade crosswalks	1,012	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Air Quality	Bicycle and Pedestrian Facilities
County	2020000123	Butte County Capital Replacement Program - Grouped Listing	Proposal is to replace capital vehicle/equipment including the retirement of vehicles: 1: 1995 aerial lift truck; 2: 1998 water truck; 3: 1994 crane truck; 4: 2000 dump truck; 5: 2000 dump truck.	650	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Other	Specific activities which do not involve or lead directly to construction
County	2020000118	South Oroville Traffic Signal at Lower Wyandotte and Monte Vista	Construct new traffic signal and remove 4 way stop	410	Section 93.127	Table 3 Projects Exempt from Regional Emissions Analyses		Intersection signalization projects at individual intersections.
BCAG	1020000171	Chico Bike Map Update	Covering the urbanized area of Chico. The Bike Map update will update the existing bike map to identify new class 1, 2 and 3 bike lanes, new roads, bike facilities, safety data and to have the map reproduced.	32	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Other	Specific activities which do not involve or lead directly to construction
BCAG	2020000110	JARC Mobility Management System Project	New mobility management system for Butte Regional Transit. Project purpose is to improve access of low and moderate income individuals to available transportation services and to other human services and community resources.	188	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Other	Specific activities which do not involve or lead directly to construction
BCAG	2020000005	FTA Sec. 5307 Program - B - Line	Butte Regional Transit. Chico UZA Area. Operations and Capital	55,588	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Mass Transit	Operating assistance to transit agencies
BCAG	2020000008	FTA Sec 5311 Program	B - Line (Butte Regional Transit) Operations and Capital	34,953	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Mass Transit	Operating assistance to transit agencies
BCAG	2020000111	SR 70 Passing Lane Projects - PSR/PDS Development	PSR/PDS Development for passing lane projects along SR 70 in Butte County for four segments from SR 70 Ophir Rd in Butte County to Butte/Yuba County line and from Butte/Yuba County line to Marysville. See MPO notes for description.	2,364	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Other	Engineering to assess social, economic, and environmental effects of the proposed action or alternatives to that action.
BCAG	2020000106	Butte Regional Transit Operations Center	In Chico, construct new Butte Regional Transit Operations Center. See MPO comments for full description	9,900	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Mass Transit	Construction of new bus or rail storage/maintenance facilities categorically excluded in 23 CFR 771.
BCAG	1020000020	Planning, Programming and Monitoring	Planning, programming and monitoring	1,680	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Other	Specific activities which do not involve or lead directly to construction
BCAG	2020000131	Butte Regional Transit Bus Replacement Program	Purchase up to 7 buses for the fixed route system	3,410	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Mass Transit	Purchase of new buses and rail cars to replace existing vehicles or for minor expansions of the fleet.
Caltrans	1020000164	Butte County SHOPP Collision Reduction Grouped Listing	SR 99 Near Chico at the Rock Creek Bridge #12-27. Widen shoulder on structure	3,940	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Safety	Shoulder improvements
Caltrans	2020000129	Butte County SHOPP Mandates Grouped Listing	SHOPP Mandates - ADA pedestrian infrastructure project on SR 32 near Chico from Kennedy Avenue to the SR 99/32 separation. Construct sidewalks, curb-ramps and crosswalks.	4,002	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Air Quality	Bicycle and Pedestrian Facilities
Caltrans	2020000162	Butte County SHOPP Bridge Preservation Grouped Listing	State Route 70 in Oroville at Flag Canyon Creek Bridge # 12-0140. Replace bridge	5,595	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Safety	Widening narrow pavements or reconstructing bridges (no additional travel lanes)
Caltrans	2020000102	SHOPP Highway Maintenance Grouped Projects	Highway Maintenance for SR 191 EA 4M270 - SR 191 PM 0 to 11.4 and for SR 99 EA 4M530 - PM 13 to 20.6. Scope of work - maintenance asphalt overlay in FY 12/13. 100% federal funding. Toll credits for match.	5,200	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Safety	Pavement resurfacing and/or rehabilitation.
Caltrans	2020000166	Butte County SHOPP Seismic Grouped Listing	Near Oroville, at Pentz Overhead #12-138 and at Cherokee Overhead #12-137. Seismic retrofit.	3,918	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Safety	Railroad/highway crossing.
Chico	2020000130	SR 99 Cohasset Rd Interchange Direct SB On Ramp	Reconfigure interchange to construct a new direct on-ramp from Eastbound Cohasset Rd to Southbound SR 99 in Chico at post mile 33.5/34.4. Scope of the this project is to complete the technical studies through preliminary engineering.	1,200	Section 93.127	Table 3 Projects Exempt from Regional Emissions Analyses		Interchange reconfiguration projects.
Chico	2020000117	SR 99 Corridor Bikeway Phase 5 - 20th Street Crossing PE	SR 99 Corridor Bikeway Project Phase 5 completes the gap adjacent to SR 99 from Chico Mall across 20th Street to the north end of Business Lane. This project is to complete the technical studies thru preliminary engineering.	200	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Air Quality	Bicycle and Pedestrian Facilities
Chico	2020000116	SR 99 Corridor Bikeway Phase 4	SR 99 Corridor Bikeway Phase 4 - Business Lane to the Skyway. This project constructs a new bike/ped/multiuse path adjacent to SR 99 from 20th Street (Business Lane) to Butte College at the Skyway/Notre Dame Blvd.	1,000	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Air Quality	Bicycle and Pedestrian Facilities
Gridley	1020000170	Hazel Street Rehabilitation Project	In the City of Gridley on Hazel Street from Virginia Street to Vermont Street. Construct intersection and roadway improvements, pavement striping as well as landscaped areas and bicycle/pedestrian facilities at the Kentucky Street intersection.	748	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Air Quality	Bicycle and Pedestrian Facilities
Oroville	2020000086	Table Mountain Blvd Roundabout	In Oroville at Table Mountain Blvd., Nelson Ave and Cherokee Rd - Reconfigure intersection and construct a roundabout.	1,547	Section 93.127	Table 3 Projects Exempt from Regional Emissions Analyses		Intersection channelization projects.
Oroville	2020000121	Oroville Street Sweeper Replacement Project	In the City of Oroville, replace 1998 street sweeper.	223	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Other	Specific activities which do not involve or lead directly to construction
Oroville	2020000122	City of Oroville Motor Grader Replacement Project	Replace 1980 motor grader	220	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Other	Specific activities which do not involve or lead directly to construction
Oroville	2020000124	City of Oroville Water Truck Replacement Project	Replace 1992 water truck.	195	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Other	Specific activities which do not involve or lead directly to construction
Oroville	2020000119	Oroville Signalization Synchronization Project	In the City of Oroville, coordinate traffic signals along Mitchell at Lincoln, Myers, Washington and Oro Dam/OroQuincy Hwy. Includes updating the signals to ADA standards, update controllers/in-vehicle detection system, street name signs, emergency preemption and cabinet upgrades.	215	Section 93.128	Traffic Signal Synchronization Projects		Traffic Signal Synchronization Projects
Various	2020000056	Local HBP - Grouped Listing - Lump Sum	Local Bridge lump sum grouping. All projects are exempt from AQ Conformity. See MPO Notes for locations and BCAG FTIP Webpage for Backup List. 9 bridge projects included.	41,405	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Safety	Pavement resurfacing and/or rehabilitation.
Various	2020000024	FTA 5310 Grouped Listing	Capital competitive grant - Lump Sum item for Butte Regional Transit and Work Training Center Paratransit vehicles and equipment. Funds for capital costs.	5,172	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Mass Transit	Purchase of new buses and rail cars to replace existing vehicles or for minor expansions of the fleet.

### MTP Projects not in 2013 FTIP

AGENCY	CTIPS ID	TITLE	PROJECT DESCRIPTION	Total (\$1,000s)	TRANSPORTATION CONFORMITY RULE - Exempt Reference			
Gridley	2020000084	SR 99 Gridley Pedestrian Project	On the east side of SR 99 from Obermeyer Ave to approx 1800 feet north of Obermeyer Ave - construct urban improvements including sidewalks and pedestrian ramps to facilitate pedestrian travel.	459	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Air Quality	Bicycle and Pedestrian Facilities
County	2020000082	Oro-Chico Hwy Bike Project	Construct Class 2 Bike lane from Midway to Butte Campus Drive along Oro Chico Hwy, Durham Dayton Hwy & Durham Pentz Rd.	1,000	Section 93.126	Table 2 Exempt Projects	Air Quality	Bicycle and Pedestrian Facilities

## APPENDIX B

### PUBLIC MEETING DOCUMENTATION

#### PUBLIC NOTICE

April 19, 2013

The Butte County Association of Governments (BCAG) is the designated Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO) in Butte County, California, and is responsible for regional transportation planning. The Clean Air Act Section 176I (42 U.S.C. 7506 I) and EPA's transportation conformity regulations (40 CFR 93.104(b) and (c)) require that BCAG's plans and programs "conform" to all applicable federal air quality requirements.

This notice is being published to provide the public with the opportunity to review and comment regarding BCAG's proposed action for a redetermination of the 2012 Metropolitan Transportation Plan (MTP) and 2013 Federal Transportation Improvement Program (FTIP) Conformity for the 2008 8-hour ozone national ambient air quality standard (NAAQS).

The conformity redetermination reaffirms all applicable conformity findings for the 2012 MTP and the 2013 FTIP and addresses additional emissions analyses and interagency consultation and public involvement required for the new 8-hour ozone standard.

A draft copy of BCAG's emissions analysis and redetermination for the 2012 MTP and 2013 FTIP has been made available online at [www.bcag.org](http://www.bcag.org). Hardcopies of the document are also available at each of the Butte County Public Libraries and at the BCAG office.

The BCAG Board of Directors has scheduled a public hearing to receive comments and consider adoption of the redetermination of the 2012 MTP and 2013 FTIP for the 2008 8-hour ozone NAAQS at their regular Board meeting on Thursday, May 23, 2013 at 9:00 a.m. at the City of Chico Council Chambers. Comments and questions can be directed to Mr. Brian Lasagna, Senior Planner for the Butte County Association of Governments at 2580 Sierra Sunrise Terrace, Suite 100, Chico CA 95928. Comments may also be phoned in at 530-879-2468, or by e-mail at [blasagna@bcag.org](mailto:blasagna@bcag.org).

**PUBLIC NOTICE**  
**May 29, 2013**

*The Butte County Association of Governments (BCAG) is designated by the U.S. Department of Transportation (DOT) and the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) as the Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO) for Butte County and its incorporated cities. As the MPO, BCAG is required to prepare a Federal Transportation Improvement program (FTIP) every two years and a long-range Regional or Metropolitan Transportation Plan (RTP/MTP) every four years. The purpose of the FTIP is to identify all transportation-related projects that require federal funding or other approval by the Federal Highway Administration (FHWA) or the Federal Transit Administration (FTA). The FTIP identifies all non-federal, regionally significant projects for information and air quality emissions modeling purposes. The FTIP indicates the area's short-term plan for use of federal dollars and other resources for the maintenance, operation, and improvement of the transportation system and the achievement of federal air quality standards over the next four federal fiscal years. Notice is hereby given that the BCAG Board of Directors is scheduled to amend the 2013 FTIP and 2012 MTP for the following:*

- *Update the Air Quality Conformity Analysis and Determination to current standards. BCAG's proposed action for a redetermination of the 2012 Metropolitan Transportation Plan (MTP) and 2013 Federal Transportation Improvement Program (FTIP) Conformity for the 2008 8-hour ozone national ambient air quality standard (NAAQS). The conformity redetermination reaffirms all applicable conformity findings for the 2012 MTP and the 2013 FTIP and addresses additional emissions analyses and interagency consultation and public involvement required for the new 8-hour ozone standard.*
- *Forest Highway 171 – Upper Skyway Reconstruction Project. This amendment re-programs the FH 171 project in order to encumber available Public Lands Highway funding for this project. This project is currently under construction; however it is not in the current 2013 FTIP/MTP. In order to utilize all available federal funds of \$479,061 remaining, the FTIP and MTP are required to be amended. This project does is exempt from air quality conformity per the EPA's Transportation Conformity Rule Section 93.126 Exempt Projects stating that pavement resurfacing and or rehabilitation are exempt. This project does not add capacity.*

Specific project information can be found under "Amendment 3" for the 2013 FTIP on line at: <http://www.bcag.org/Planning/FTIP/index.html>. Amendment to the 2012 MTP/SCS to incorporate this amendment will be made as well. A draft copy of BCAG's emissions analysis and redetermination for the 2012 MTP and 2013 FTIP has been made available online at [www.bcag.org](http://www.bcag.org). Hardcopies of the document are also available at each of the Butte County Public Libraries and at the BCAG office.

The BCAG Board of Directors has scheduled a public hearing for this amendment and to receive comments and consider adoption of the redetermination of the 2012 MTP and 2013 FTIP for the 2008 8-hour ozone NAAQS at their regular Board meeting on Thursday, June 27, 2013 at 9:00 a.m. at the City of Chico Council Chambers. Comments and questions regarding the FTIP or the MTP/SCS can be directed to Ivan Garcia, Programming Manager at BCAG at 530-8792468 or by e-mail at [igarcia@bcag.org](mailto:igarcia@bcag.org).





## BCAG BOARD OF DIRECTORS

## Item #12 Action

June 27, 2013

### **PUBLIC HEARING AND APPROVAL OF AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY REDETERMINATION FOR 2012 METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION PLAN AND 2013 FEDERAL TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM**

**PREPARED BY:** Brian Lasagna, Senior Planner

**ISSUE:** On March 27, 2008, the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) strengthened the 8-hour ozone national ambient air quality standard (NAAQS). Following a lengthy approval process, the 2008 ozone NAAQS became effective July 20, 2012. Areas that do not meet the 2008 ozone NAAQS, including Butte County, are designated as non-attainment. As a result of the areas non-attainment designation, conformity needs to be re-determined for the 2012 Metropolitan Transportation Plan (MTP) and 2013 Federal Transportation Improvement Program (FTIP) for the new 8-hour ozone standard by July 20, 2013.

**DISCUSSION:** The Butte County region has been designated by EPA as being non-attainment for the 2008 ozone NAAQS and must show compliance with these new requirements by July 20, 2013. The region is also considered non-attainment under the previous standard (1997 ozone NAAQS). Working in consultation with the BCAG's Interagency Consultation Review (ICR) group and Transportation Advisory Committee (TAC), BCAG has prepared an air quality conformity redetermination for the 2012 MTP and 2013 FTIP, in order to meet the new 2008 8-hour ozone standards.

The ozone conformity re-determination reaffirms all applicable conformity findings for the 2012 MTP and the 2013 FTIP and addresses additional emissions analyses and interagency consultation and public involvement required for the new 8-hour ozone standard.

On April 19, 2013, BCAG published a notice to provide the public with the opportunity to review and comment regarding BCAG's proposed action for the air quality redetermination. A copy of the public notice and BCAG's emissions analysis and redetermination for the 2012 MTP and 2013 FTIP are included as attachment #1 and available online at <http://www.bcag.org/Planning/2012-MTP/index.html>. Hardcopies of the document were also made available at the BCAG offices and each of the Butte County Public Libraries.

The public review period began on April 22<sup>nd</sup>, 2013 and is scheduled to conclude at the June 27, 2013 meeting of the BCAG Board of Director's, in which the Board will

**BCAG Board of Directors**  
**June 27, 2013 – Agenda Item #12**  
**Page 2**

conclude the public hearing and consider approval of the redetermination. To date, no comments have been received from the public regarding the redetermination.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Staff is requesting that the Board of Directors hold a public hearing to solicit final comments on the air quality conformity redetermination. If no significant comments are received, staff is recommending the Board of Directors approve Resolution 2012/2013 - 20, adopting the air quality conformity redetermination for the 2012 MTP and 2013 FTIP.

Key Staff: Ivan Garcia, Programming Manager  
Brian Lasagna, Senior Planner

**APPENDIX C**  
**RESPONSES TO PUBLIC COMMENTS**

*(none received)*

## APPENDIX D

### CONFORMITY CHECKLIST

#### FHWA Checklist for MPO TIPs/RTPs Checklist/Version Date: June 27, 2005

40 CFR	Criteria	Page	Comments
§93.102	Document the applicable pollutants and precursors for which EPA designates the area as nonattainment or maintenance. Describe the nonattainment or maintenance area and its boundaries.	p. 1-3	
§93.104 (b, c)	Document the date that the MPO officially adopted, accepted or approved the TIP/RTP and made a conformity determination. Include a copy of the MPO resolution. Include the date of the last prior conformity finding.	p. 1	
§93.104 (e)	If the conformity determination is being made to meet the timelines included in this section, document when the new motor vehicle emissions budget was approved or found adequate.	N/A	
§93.106 (a)(2)ii	Describe the regionally significant additions or modifications to the existing transportation network that are expected to be open to traffic in each analysis year. Document that the design concept and scope of projects allows adequate model representation to determine intersections with regionally significant facilities, route options, travel times, transit ridership and land use.	p. 4-7 p. 11-12 Tables 3-6	
§93.108	Document that the TIP/RTP is financially constrained (23 CFR 450).	p. 8	
§93.109 (a, b)	Document that the TIP/RTP complies with any applicable conformity requirements of air quality implementation plans (SIPs) and court orders.	p. 16	
§93.109 (c-k)	Provide either a table or text description that details, for each pollutant and precursor, whether the interim emissions tests and/or the budget test apply for conformity. Indicate which emissions budgets have been found adequate by EPA, and which budgets are currently applicable for what analysis years.	p. 12-15	
§93.110 (a, b)	Document the use of latest planning assumptions (source and year) at the "time the conformity analysis begins," including current and future population, employment, travel and congestion. Document the use of the most recent available vehicle registration data. Document the date upon which the conformity analysis was begun.	p. 3-7 Table 1	
USDOT/EPA guidance	Document the use of planning assumptions less than five years old. If unable, include written justification for the use of older data. (1/18/02)	p. 3-7	
§93.110 (c,d,e,f)	Document any changes in transit operating policies and assumed ridership levels since the previous conformity determination. Document the use of the latest transit fares and road and bridge tolls. Document the use of the latest information on the effectiveness of TCMs and other SIP measures that have been implemented. Document the key assumptions and show that they were agreed to through Interagency and public consultation.	p. 5&8	No TCMs
§93.111	Document the use of the latest emissions model approved by EPA.	p. 9	
§93.112	Document fulfillment of the interagency and public consultation requirements outlined in a specific implementation plan according to §51.390 or, if a SIP revision has not been completed, according to §93.105 and 23 CFR 450. Include documentation of consultation on conformity tests and methodologies as well as responses to written comments.	p. 8	
§93.113	Document timely implementation of all TCMs in approved SIPs. Document	p. 8	No TCMs

40 CFR	Criteria	Page	Comments
	that implementation is consistent with schedules in the applicable SIP and document whether anything interferes with timely implementation. Document any delayed TCMs in the applicable SIP and describe the measures being taken to overcome obstacles to implementation.		
§93.114	Document that the conformity analyses performed for the TIP is consistent with the analysis performed for the Plan, in accordance with 23 CFR 450.324(f)(2).	p. 1	
§93.118 (a, c, e)	<u>For areas with SIP budgets:</u> Document that emissions from the transportation network for each applicable pollutant and precursor, including projects in any associated donut area that are in the Statewide TIP and regionally significant non-Federal projects, are consistent with any adequate or approved motor vehicle emissions budget for all pollutants and precursors in applicable SIPs.	p. 12	
§93.118 (b)	Document for which years consistency with motor vehicle emissions budgets must be shown.	p. 10	
§93.118 (d)	Document the use of the appropriate analysis years in the regional emissions analysis for areas with SIP budgets, and the analysis results for these years. Document any interpolation performed to meet tests for years in which specific analysis is not required.	p. 10	
§93.119 <sup>1</sup>	<u>For areas without applicable SIP budgets:</u> Document that emissions from the transportation network for each applicable pollutant and precursor, including projects in any associated donut area that are in the Statewide TIP and regionally significant non-Federal projects, are consistent with the requirements of the “Action/Baseline”, “Action/1990” and/or “Action/2002” interim emissions tests as applicable.	p. 12-13	
§93.119 (g)	Document the use of the appropriate analysis years in the regional emissions analysis for areas without applicable SIP budgets.	p. 12-13	
§93.119 (h,i)	Document how the baseline and action scenarios are defined for each analysis year.	p. 12-13	
§93.122 (a)(1)	Document that all regionally significant federal and non-Federal projects in the nonattainment/maintenance area are explicitly modeled in the regional emissions analysis. For each project, identify by which analysis it will be open to traffic. Document that VMT for non-regionally significant Federal projects is accounted for in the regional emissions analysis	p. 10-12	
§93.122 (a)(2, 3)	Document that only emission reduction credits from TCMs on schedule have been included, or that partial credit has been taken for partially implemented TCMs. Document that the regional emissions analysis only includes emissions credit for projects, programs, or activities that require regulatory action if: the regulatory action has been adopted; the project, program, activity or a written commitment is included in the SIP; EPA has approved an opt-in to the program, EPA has promulgated the program, or the Clean Air Act requires the program (indicate applicable date). Discuss the implementation status of these programs and the associated emissions credit for each analysis year.	p. 8	No TCMs
§93.122 (a)(4,5,6)	For nonregulatory measures that are not included in the STIP, include written commitments from appropriate agencies. Document that assumptions for measures outside the transportation system (e.g. fuels measures) are the same for baseline and action scenarios. Document that factors such as ambient temperature are consistent with those used in the SIP unless modified through interagency consultation.	p. 9	
§93.122 (b)(1)(i) <sup>ii</sup>	Document that a network-based travel model is in use that is validated against observed counts for a base year no more than 10 years before the	p. 7	

40 CFR	Criteria	Page	Comments
	date of the conformity determination. Document that the model results have been analyzed for reasonableness and compared to historical trends and explain any significant differences between past trends and forecasts (for per capita vehicle-trips, VMT, trip lengths mode shares, time of day, etc.).		
§93.122 (b)(1)(ii) <sup>2</sup>	Document the land use, population, employment, and other network-based travel model assumptions.	p. 3-7	
§93.122 (b)(1)(iii) <sup>2</sup>	Document how land use development scenarios are consistent with future transportation system alternatives, and the reasonable distribution of employment and residences for each alternative.	p. 3-7	
§93.122 (b)(1)(iv) <sup>2</sup>	Document use of capacity sensitive assignment methodology and emissions estimates based on a methodology that differentiates between peak and off-peak volumes and speeds, and bases speeds on final assigned volumes.	p. 3-7	
§93.122 (b)(1)(v) <sup>2</sup>	Document the use of zone-to-zone travel impedances to distribute trips in reasonable agreement with the travel times estimated from final assigned traffic volumes. Where transit is a significant factor, document that zone-to-zone travel impedances used to distribute trips are used to model mode split.	p. 3-7	
§93.122 (b)(1)(vi) <sup>2</sup>	Document how travel models are reasonably sensitive to changes in time, cost, and other factors affecting travel choices.	p. 3-7	
§93.122 (b)(2) <sup>2</sup>	Document that reasonable methods were used to estimate traffic speeds and delays in a manner sensitive to the estimated volume of travel on each roadway segment represented in the travel model.	p. 3-7	
§93.122 (b)(3) <sup>2</sup>	Document the use of HPMS, or a locally developed count-based program or procedures that have been chosen through the consultation process, to reconcile and calibrate the network-based travel model estimates of VMT.	p. 3-7	
§93.122 (d)	In areas not subject to §93.122(b), document the continued use of modeling techniques or the use of appropriate alternative techniques to estimate vehicle miles traveled	p. 3-7	
§93.122 (e, f)	Document, in areas where a SIP identifies construction-related PM10 or PM 2.5 as significant pollutants, the inclusion of PM10 and/or PM 2.5 construction emissions in the conformity analysis.	N/A	
§93.122 (g)	If appropriate, document that the conformity determination relies on a previous regional emissions analysis and is consistent with that analysis.	N/A	
§93.126, §93.127, §93.128	Document all projects in the TIP/RTP that are exempt from conformity requirements or exempt from the regional emissions analysis. Indicate the reason for the exemption (Table 2, Table 3, traffic signal synchronization) and that the interagency consultation process found these projects to have no potentially adverse emissions impacts.	p. 8 App. A	

<sup>i</sup> Note that some areas are required to complete both interim emissions tests.

<sup>ii</sup> 40 CFR 93.122(b) refers only to serious, severe and extreme ozone areas and serious CO areas above 200,000 population

#### Disclaimers

This checklist is intended solely as an informational guideline to be used in reviewing Transportation Plans and Transportation Improvement Programs for adequacy of their conformity documentation. It is in no way intended to replace or supercede the Transportation Conformity regulations of 40 CFR Parts 51 and 93, the Statewide and Metropolitan Planning Regulations of 23 CFR Part 450 or any other EPA, FHWA or FTA guidance pertaining to transportation conformity or statewide and metropolitan planning. This checklist is not intended for use in documenting transportation conformity for individual transportation projects in nonattainment or maintenance areas. 40 CFR Parts 51 and 93 contain additional criteria for project-level conformity determinations.

Document #46711